



LE GOUVERNEMENT  
DU GRAND-DUCHÉ DE LUXEMBOURG  
Ministère des Affaires étrangères  
et européennes

Direction de la coopération  
au développement et  
de l'action humanitaire

# **Evaluation of six development NGOs accredited by the Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg**

## **Synthesis report CARE IN LUXEMBOURG (CIL)**

EVAL/2013/01

Extract of the final version dated December, 12 2013 :  
Fact-sheet and Executive summary

*In 2013, the Directorate of Development Cooperation and humanitarian action of the Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs commissioned an independent evaluation of six development NGOs accredited by the Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg, included the NGO Nouvelle Pro Niños Pobres. The evaluation was conducted by the consortium Artemis/Insyde. The Ministry publishes below a summary of the main results of this exercise.*

*Observations, assessments and recommendations expressed in this document represent the views of the evaluators and do not necessarily reflect those of the Ministry.*



### FACT-SHEET

CIL	Established in	Accredited in	Framework agreement since	Co-financed since	Previous evaluation
	2008	2009	N/A.	2010	No
Missions	Support to the operations of CARE International throughout the world as a partner to the poor.				
Axes of intervention	Emergency assistance and the fight against poverty				
Financing tools	Donations, public financing (MAE) and contributions from other members of the international network				
Strategy	Roots in the North as a representative of populations suffering from poverty, famine and deprivation				
No. projects	7 projects in progress: Kenya (2), Laos (3) and Niger (2)				
No. sectors	Food security, maternal and child health, community commitment, education				
Budget and Implementation rate	Projects have started recently. 950,000 euros for the 3 projects in Laos and 1.1 Mb euro for both projects in Niger.				
<b>Results</b>					
Organisational & structural audit	CIL is an offshoot from CARE Germany Luxembourg which was established in March 2008, and CIL still maintains close relations with its parent NGO for technical, administrative and financial aspects. CIL operates with 3 permanent employees and 17 volunteers involved in the administration and management of the NGO.				
Strategic & operational analysis	CIL has adopted the vision of CARE International as its own and has integrated the partnership model by adapting it to the conditions of the local Luxembourg context: it therefore focuses its development initiatives on MAE cooperation partner countries				
Evaluation of a sample of projects	The projects supported by CIL are all located in difficult areas where the living conditions of the local populations are more than vulnerable, whether the areas suffer from a lack of security (Niger) or access difficulties (Laos). This requires regular and intense support and results are promising, but can take time to be achieved.				
Accounting and financial audit	Only marginal problems were detected in the "light" financial audit. The internal financial and accounting procedures used by the CARE International network are clear, reliable and well applied.				
<b>Conclusions</b>					
CIL is still a recent NGO, although its support network for operations is long-standing, experienced and well established in many countries. CIL would be able to manage a framework agreement thanks to the support of the network and subject to certain conditions relating to independence. This would require strategic consideration of operating priorities (theme and country), as well as how to organise relations with the local offices of CARE international.					
<b>Principle recommendations</b>					
Short term	Improve project tracking (collection of all documents) and reporting (inspection tracking records). <i>Already accepted and implemented by the NGO.</i>				
Medium term	Clarify relations with CARE Germany Luxembourg. Shorten the operational, legal and financial chain used to manage the projects, which is lengthy and over-bureaucratic, although well-controlled.				
Long term	In view of progressing towards a request for a framework agreement with MAE, consider an articulated and consistent approach/operating strategy, which could be applied to a series of projects covering equal periods,				







## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

---

### 1 The mandate

This work has been carried out in the context of the service contract granted to Artemis, in a consortium with the company, InSyDe, to evaluate 6 NGO that benefit from financial aid from MAE either through co-financing or framework agreements. Over and beyond the overall appraisal of the NGO and its operation in the context of MAE co-financing, the evaluation also aimed to precisely answer the following questions, which are more specific to the situation of CARE Luxembourg: Does the NGO hold the necessary capacity and Luxembourg funding to manage a framework agreement, considering that 5 co-financing projects are underway or have been completed at the current time? How is Care Luxembourg positioned within the Care International network and how are its responsibilities distributed within the network? How independent is the Luxembourg office in real terms?

Four operations have been carried out simultaneously for this purpose:

-  An organisational and structural audit
-  An evaluation of the strategic and operational approach of the NGO
-  A limited accounting and financial audit
-  An light evaluation of a sample of projects.

### 2 The NGO evaluated

CIL was established in March 2008 and received MAE accreditation as a development NGO in September 2009. CIL is an offshoot of CARE Germany Luxembourg and is part of the CARE International network on this basis. CIL focuses on emergency assistance and combating poverty and has adopted the mission of CARE International as a partner of the most deprived. CIL rapidly secured its position in the Luxembourg context and initially exclusively took action providing assistance in emergency situations. The NGO has recently submitted several applications for co-financing to MAE, and is taking action in this context in the sectors of food security, maternal and child health care, community commitment and education in Kenya, Laos and Niger.

CIL operates with 3 permanent employees (the Director, a project coordinator and an administrative assistant) and 17 volunteers involved in the administration and management of the NGO.

### 3 The approach and methodology implemented

The improvement of the quality of interventions is the central concern of the work of evaluation. It is not a case of rating the actors involved but of helping them reviewing their practices, not only in their relations with MAE who finances them, but also in terms of their relationship with local partners who are implementing the projects in the field. The work of evaluation is an integral part of the project and is one of its "natural" stage.

Work was launched in April 2013 with a kick-off meeting between the evaluation team, the MAE and the NGO. It was followed up by a documentary study (documents gathered from the NGO) and by a series of meetings at the head office of the NGO with the permanent team and members of the board. This first part of the work was the subject of a discussion with the MAE and the NGO in July. The missions were then organised in the field in August (in Niger) and in October (Laos). An exploratory mission to the CARE Laos office was organised in June in order to prepare for later field inspections.

This report is the synthesis of all the above.

The Artemis/InSyDe consortium mobilised several experts to contribute to the work on the organisational and strategic aspects (Marc Roure), on the project aspects (Mani Vanh in

Laos and Mohamadou Garba in Niger), on the accounting and financial aspects (Floriane Herzog for the RSM office) and on the overall synthesis (Thierry Paccoud).

#### 4 The results of the evaluation

CARE Luxembourg maintains close organisational and operational relations with CARE Germany Luxembourg via a Partnership agreement which guarantees risk management and is therefore extremely positive: CARE Luxembourg benefits from the advantages of the CARE International network without having to meet institutional costs. A high level of transparency is however maintained throughout.

Although CIL is not a fully-fledged member of the CARE international network, it has adopted all of its organisational documents and the structure of the network. This formal framework is impressive as it governs all relations between members and with the different partners, the implementation of operations and behaviour and codes of conduct. This framework guarantees the effective and transparent execution of projects.

The CARE international network also provides members with projects and this also applies for CARE-Luxembourg. The projects in both Niger and Laos have been identified in the context of the network: CARE Germany Luxembourg was already working with the NGO, Hed Tamat, in Niger. Relations with CARE-Luxembourg started in this context (*MAE financing from 2007*); The CARE office in Laos stated its need for financing to support the isolated populations in the north (Phongsalay) and the south (Sekong and Dakcheung).

Humanitarian assistance is the main mission of CIL (100% of its activities when it was created, approximately 50% today) however, CIL aims to ensure the more long-term tracking of emergency support and provide support for the most deprived populations in view of local conditions thanks to co-financing. CIL has therefore been committed to development projects co-financed by MAE since 2010. Seven such projects are currently in progress: 2 in Kenya, 3 in Laos and 2 in Niger.

The projects are implemented in vulnerable areas facing either security issues or access difficulties. Results can often therefore take longer to achieve and outcomes are often more dependent on the frequency and intensity of the actions taken for populations. Despite this, initial results are encouraging. In Niger, community commitment has led to greater awareness and the preparation of training and educational initiatives. In Laos, operations targeting villages and groupings (at the embryonic stage) are starting to have an effect both in terms of family planning (Phongsaly province) and food security (Sekong province).

Only marginal problems were detected in the "light" financial audit. The internal financial and accounting procedures used by the CARE International network are clear, reliable and well applied.

#### 5 Conclusions and Good Practices

CIL is still a recent NGO, although its support network for operations is long-standing, experienced and well established in many countries. Within the CARE international network, the position of CIL has not yet been totally clarified, particularly in terms of its relations with CARE Germany Luxembourg. The international network is currently reconsidering its future and opportunities will most certainly arise, ensuring CIL plays an appropriate role.

CIL has globally proved its ability to implement and follow-up the execution of projects in vulnerable areas (Touareg zone of Niger, isolated regions in Laos) with reference to co-financed projects. CIL would be able to manage a framework agreement thanks to the support of the network and subject to certain conditions relating to independence. This would require strategic consideration of operating priorities (theme and country), as well as how to organise relations with the local offices of CARE international.

In financial terms, the presentation of the statement of income and expenses and the total amount committed to the project in question ("Rückstellungen Projekte" heading), with no effect on balance sheet results, was most certainly helpful. Many NGO attempt to track the amount committed in own capital via various accounting policies, with varying degrees of explicitness and structuring. Some NGO simply track the level of their own capital (or equity), or even track transactions for their bank accounts.

In Laos, in particular, a series of baseline studies were carried out prior to scheduling the operations of the local office. This approach identified the most at-risk populations and analysed their vulnerabilities. These studies were carried out by experts recruited specially for this purpose, but in close cooperation with the local CARE teams, and with local authorities when feasible.

## 6 Recommendations

### 6.1 General recommendations

#### MAE

Consider, jointly with the NGO, how to apply geographic concentration criteria, particularly for international NGO. Large NGO have the means of taking action, via their networks, wherever they deem appropriate. Financing from Luxembourg must therefore be reserved for cooperation partner countries. *The NGO has already accepted to improve these aspects from 2014, by closing corporation projects in Kenya and focusing its operations in partner countries, Niger and Laos.*

Clarify the expectations and requirements of MAE with reference to risk evaluation for a project towards the end of the cycle: internal or external evaluation, procedures and parties involved, budget.

More specifically for Laos, promote discussion between the agencies carrying out the projects financed by the various cooperation instruments (bilateral cooperation, multilateral cooperation, mutli-bi cooperation and cooperation via NGO).

Consider the resources to be deployed to assist NGO to collect basic information on context and policies in the target regions and segments.

#### CARE Luxembourg

Clarify relations with CARE Germany Luxembourg.

Shorten the operational, legal and financial chain used to manage the project, which is lengthy and over-bureaucratic, although well-controlled. This will require greater reliability for local partners and the CIL team must be expanded. The current team includes one single project coordinator. One project manager can track 8 projects in parallel on average. If the standing team is limited to 2.5 PTE, the use of volunteers to manage projects could be considered. Other NGO use this approach (e.g.: PSF Luxembourg).

In view of progressing towards a request for a framework agreement with MAE, consider a articulated and consistent approach/operating strategy, which could be applied to a series of projects covering equal periods and which are not only contributions to the strategies of the local CARE International offices. *The programmatic strategy developed by CARE Luxembourg in this context represents an initial stage (consistent geographic guidelines, targeted group of beneficiaries - isolated and extremely poor populations, ethnic minorities - consistent operational approach - development of groups of women, community*

*commitment - with clear targets - maternal health, integral development with female empowerment as a priority -).*

## 6.2 Specific recommendations to the attention of CIL

We consider it important that 1) CIL ensures the appropriate integration of MAE requirements in the contract concluded at the end of the chain with the local partner, 2) CIL holds a copy of this contract for each co-financed project. In practical terms, an informative record, previously prepared by CIL (list of project tracking requirements) should be enclosed in appendix to the contract concluded with the partner, integrating these requirements as contractual obligations for the partner (project reporting or financing conditions). *This recommendation has already been accepted and implemented by the NGO.*

Project management requires that CIL possesses and manages all project documentation on its promises, including documents which are currently in the possession of country offices and/or Care Germany Luxembourg. Project management also requires direct relations to be established between CARE Luxembourg and the local CARE offices executing the co-financed projects via specific "Individual Project Implementation Agreements (IPIA)".

Decisions reached during the monitoring missions and the actions to be taken by all parties must be indicated in the project monitoring reports in the form of an action plan enclosed in appendix to the reports and forwarded to the partner (post-mission letter). This recommendation has already been accepted by CIL.