



GRAND-DUCHÉ DE LUXEMBOURG

Ministère des Affaires étrangères

Direction de la coopération au développement

Evaluation of six development NGOs accredited by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg

Synthesis report of the evaluation Eng Breck Mat Lateinamerika (EBMLA)

EVAL/2013/01

Extract of the final version dated December, 11 2013 :
Fact-sheet and Executive summary

In 2013, the Directorate of Development Cooperation of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs commissioned an independent evaluation of six development NGOs accredited by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg, included the NGO Eng Breck Mat Lateinamerika (EBMLA). The evaluation was conducted by the consortium Artemis/Insyde. The Ministry publishes below a summary of the main results of this exercise.

Observations, assessments and recommendations expressed in this document represent the views of the evaluators and do not necessarily reflect those of the Ministry.

FACT-SHEET

EBMLA	Established in	Accredited in	Framework agreement since	Previous evaluation in
	1986	1987	2001	Yes
Missions	Help suffering populations in Latin America to break the vicious circle of poverty			
Axes of intervention	Agrarian development to the benefit of rural populations and social and educational support to the benefit of peri-urban populations			
Financing tools	Framework agreement, own funds, near-systematic local contributions			
Strategy	Assist suffering rural and peri-urban populations in the poorest countries of Latin America (Colombia, Peru, Bolivia and Ecuador)			
No. projects	15			
No. sectors	3 (agriculture, social and educational support, rural tourism)			
Budget	5 250 000 euros over 5 years (2011-2015)			

Results	Strengths/Opening	Weaknesses/Risks
Organisational & structural audit	Strong commitment and leadership from the President and Secretary. Increased commitment from young volunteers. Serious options for the future.	The President and Secretary still hold most powers.
Strategic & operational analysis	A clear and well defined strategy, consistent with operations. Formal relations with partners.	Extension of sector-based cover to a non-traditional sector (tourism)
Sample evaluation of projects	Understanding of MFA project management and reporting tools (LF/PCM) at EBMLA level. Reinforced project tracking	Risk in relation to the performance of projects, mainly dependent on a sometimes weak formulation of projects and logical frameworks

Conclusions

Five years after the 1st evaluation of EBMLA, powers and decisions remain attributable to the President and the Secretary, who oversee most of the day-to-day management and governance functions for the NGO. The NGO is taking action to better distribute responsibility for monitoring its operations. It is currently considering serious options of guaranteeing its continuity. Relations with almost all partners are now formally established in the form of partnership agreements, and project monitoring has been reinforced. EBMLA and three of its partners (in Colombia and Bolivia) can rely on the support of a network of qualified cooperants with technical and/or managerial added value.




Principle recommendations

Short term	Share the results of project evaluations with partners, jointly decide on their relevance and adjust project formulation if necessary.
Medium term	Jointly define a strategy with APU, for its institutional reinforcement. Reconsider the issue of the sustainability of projects in progress. Strengthen capacities of the 3 volunteers in charge of the projects monitoring (country distribution).
Long term	Continue giving real form to current options for the future of the NGO.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1 The mandate

This work has been carried out in the context of the services contract granted to Artemis, in a consortium with the company InSyDe, to evaluate 6 NGOs that benefit from financial support from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs either through co-financing or framework agreements. This evaluation had two precise aims: assess the ability of EBMLA to effectively and efficiently implement the projects supported by MFA and assess whether the partnership concluded between MFA and EBMLA is relevant and suitable. Three operations were carried out simultaneously for this purpose and in the context of a framework agreement with an NGO:

-  An organisational and structural audit
-  An evaluation of the strategic and operational approach
-  An evaluation of a sample of projects.

2 The NGO evaluated

EBMLA was founded at the initiative of Father René Fisch in 1986 and accredited as an NGO by MAE in 1987. The NGO aims to "help suffering populations in Latin America to break the vicious circle of poverty". The NGO targets the poorest countries in Spanish-speaking Latin America: Colombia, Peru, Bolivia and Ecuador.

3 The approach and the methodology implemented

The improvement of the quality of interventions is the central concern of the work of evaluation. It is not a case of rating the actors involved but of helping them reviewing their practices, not only in their relationship with the MFA who finances them, but also in terms of their relationship with local partners who are implementing the projects in the field. The work of evaluation is an integral part of the project cycle and is one of its "natural" stage.

Work was launched in April 2013 with a kick-off meeting between the evaluation team, the MFA and the NGO. It was followed up by a documentary study (documents gathered from the NGO) and by a series of interviews at the head office of the NGO with directors, executive board members and volunteers. This first phase of the work was the subject of a discussion with the MFA and the NGO in July. The missions were organised in the field in August (in Peru and Bolivia).

This report is the synthesis of all the above.

The Artemis/InSyDe consortium mobilised several experts to contribute to the work on the organisational and strategic aspects (Marc Roure), on the project aspects (Gabriela López Sotomayor and Angelica Arriola Miranda in Peru; Jaqueline Durán Cossio and David Torres in Bolivia) and on the overall synthesis (Sandrine Beaujean).

4 The results of the evaluation






Organisational and structural audit. Powers and decisions remain attributable to the President and the Secretary, who oversee most of the day-to-day management and governance functions of the NGO, however competences are currently being delegated to volunteers for project monitoring purposes. The NGO has long-standing roots in Luxembourg and benefits from a certain appeal. In the field, the NGO is supported by a network of cooperants who provide added value. The financial situation of the NGO is healthy, despite the decrease in donations.

Strategic and operational analysis EBMLA applies a clear and defined development support strategy. Sector-based cover has been extended for this framework agreement. The NGO has a near-systematic policy of local funds contributions. EBMLA and its local partners have developed close relations based on trust and a formal and reinforced monitoring






system adapted to the partner. The nature of relations between EBMLA and its partners varies from one partner to another. Its relations are administrative with APU, and represent "near"-institutional cooperation with CAM/Social Pastoral Caritas de Sacaba, in Bolivia, and institutional cooperation with K'Anchay.

The traditional, but limited, evaluation of 4 projects is resumed below based on the 5 assessment criteria of the DAD/OECD. A colour code is assigned to each criterion based on the level of achievement (green for fully achieved/guaranteed, orange for partially achieved/guaranteed and red for not achieved/guaranteed).






CADEFOR - Development of agroforestry and fruit reforestation in the Maras area; Partner: APU; Peru

 Relevancy	Inadequate social and environmental analysis
 Effectiveness	Too early
 Efficiency	Too early
 Impact	Too early. Reconsider project strategies and priorities
 Sustainability	Fragile structure of the partner. Water concern.






CAFTUR, Technical support and training for rural tourism; Partner: APU; Peru

 Relevancy	No real market study
 Effectiveness	Too early
 Efficiency	Too early
 Impact	Too early. Reconsider project strategies and priorities
 Sustainability	Difficult to determine without a market study. Fragile structure of the partner.

Agroforestry production and integral human resources training in the Agroecological educational community of Vila Vila; Partner: K'Anchay; Bolivia

 Relevancy	Targets the main concerns in the region, in line with national policies
 Effectiveness	Generally effective, with a few weak points in terms of formulation
 Efficiency	Efficiency confirmed
 Impact	Difficult to measure generally. Specific results are perceptible.
 Sustainability	The technical abilities required are present. Short-term financial capacity (frequent factor for educational projects).

Support for the Home for women, teenage girls and children, victims of domestic and sexual violence; Partner: Social Pastoral Caritas de Sacaba, Bolivia

Relevancy 	Confirmed relevancy. High level of violence towards women. Few host structures.
Effectiveness 	Generally effective, with a few weak points in terms of formulation
Efficiency 	Generally efficient, risk of dispersion of efforts.
Impact 	Difficult to measure generally. Specific results are perceptible.
Sustainability 	Technical resources either exist or are being acquired. Financial risk due to the sector and the strong dependence of the partner on EBMLA

5 Conclusions

The structure of EBMLA is still strongly based on the President and the Secretary of the NGO. Project monitoring still strongly depends on the ability of the Secretary, who does not yet offset the recent distribution of projects per country between volunteers. The increasing commitment of a few motivated young volunteers raises serious openings for the future and continuity of the NGO.

EBMLA is supported by a network of qualified cooperants providing technical and managerial added value for both projects and local partners. The position of cooperants can sometimes be delicate with reference to local partners. The risk of conflict of interest can sometimes arise due to the position occupied.

EBMLA has created a reinforced monitoring system, which is structured and adjusted depending on each partner. EBMLA is also currently formalising its relations with partners. The partners of EBMLA vary in terms of their management and organisational capacities. Their understanding and use of PCM tools vary, and are sometimes inadequate. The nature of the partnership depends strongly on the institutional capacities of the partner and the presence or absence of a cooperant.

In Bolivia, the evaluation of the performance of the projects visited is globally positive. In Peru, it is still too early to reach any conclusions on the overall performance of projects. However, the absence of any prior studies relevant to project formulations could compromise the overall performance.

6 Recommendations

Recommendations
Strategic
For the partner APU, clearly define the means of improvements required to reinforce the strategic and organisational development of the association and projects
Organisational and structural
Continue increasing the capacities of volunteers with the project coordinator (the Secretary)
Ensure that the question of the future and continuity remains at the heart of priorities
Revise and formally define the role of cooperants
On projects
Revise the conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation reports jointly with local partners and take account of these aspects in case of potential projects reformulation