

Ministry of Foreign and European Affairs, Directorate for Development
Cooperation and Humanitarian Affairs, Luxembourg

EVALUATION – Objectif Tiers Monde

Executive summary

July 2019

Bob Peters

Myriam Duret



LE GOUVERNEMENT
DU GRAND-DUCHÉ DE LUXEMBOURG
Ministère des Affaires étrangères
et européennes

Direction de la coopération
au développement et
de l'action humanitaire



July 2019

The evaluation was conducted by South Research. The Ministry publishes below a summary of the main results of this exercise. Observations, assessments and recommendations expressed in this document represent the views of the evaluators and do not necessarily reflect those of the Ministry.

South Research CVBA - VSO
Leuvenestraat 5/2
B – 3010 Kessel - Lo
Belgium
T + 32 (0)16 49 83 10
F + 32 (0)16 49 83 19

www.southresearch.be
info@southresearch.be

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This executive summary is about the assessment of the organizational structure of OTM and the implementation of the programme 2015-2019 co-financed by the MAEE.

OTM is already active in Haiti since 1984 and in this fourth framework agreement (AC), which covers the period 2015-2019, it supports educational development (4 primary schools and a vocational training centre), access to water and capacity building of 6 partners in the regions of Café Lompré, Carrefour and Beau Séjour with a total budget of 2.187.500 €, of which 1.750.000 € comes from the MAEE.

The Findings

OTM is an organization with a staff of 2.5 FTEs supported by several volunteers. These volunteers have several functions: some take care of very specific tasks such as sending documents, translating documents, collecting funds, etc. Others play or have played a very important role in the implementation and monitoring of concrete projects such as school construction, water turbine installation or training in teaching skills. This involvement of volunteers is an asset but, being highly dependent on these volunteers, the organization faces challenges that it does not sufficiently master. Volunteers have to adhere to the mission, vision and values that the organization finds important. Currently South Research (SR) find that the mission and the vision in general and on partnership specifically, and the values to which the organization adheres, are not sufficiently clarified and shared by the volunteers. This causes misunderstandings and conflicts between the volunteers themselves and between volunteers and staff of the organization. A negative effect of the dependence on volunteers is that with the departure of the key volunteers responsible for e.g. the agricultural technical component of the programme or the installation of the turbine, these components are not completed and the organization cannot guarantee the sustainability of these interventions.

The organisation has an organizational chart specifying the roles of different structures and the roles volunteers can play in the organization. In theory, the proposed structure can work well, but given the fact that a person occupies several functions and that the functions and hierarchies are not well formulated, decision-making and the ability to resolve conflicts between people or between committees are very limited. In addition, the organization has difficulties renewing its group of volunteers: currently most of the volunteers are retired persons who have held positions of responsibility in industries or organizations and bring very specific knowledge to the organization.

OTM invests in areas such as access to basic education, literacy and technical education, access to water and increased income-generating activities. Given the Haitian context, investing in the aforementioned areas is still relevant, particularly because they are priority areas for the Haitian government that has no financial and human resources and no coherent education policy. Because of a lack of more detailed analysis, it is difficult to make an accurate judgment on the relevance of OTM interventions. For lack of an in-depth analysis of why vulnerable families do not send children to school and an analysis of the number

and coverage of schools in the three regions, it is difficult to evaluate the relevance of building new schools. The fact that the number of children leave school at a young age and that some schools in the neighbourhood of the schools built by OTM have problems to attract children, leads SR to question the relevance of the construction of some new schools.

OTM has built good quality infrastructure. After the earthquake in 2010 OTM built high quality anti-seismic schools based on plans developed by Luxembourg volunteers and materials imported from Luxembourg. The CREOS worker volunteers and water and electricity specialists installed a turbine, generators and power lines with recovery equipment from Luxembourg. The installation is of good quality but, given the low level of expertise available in Haiti as well as the lack of spare parts, there are problems of sustainability of this installation.

All activities, except the construction of a cassava mill, are executed as planned in the AC. The number of children who go to school is reached as well as the number of people with access to water. SR can confirm that the *outputs or the immediate results* of most activities are achieved and that these *outputs* are highly appreciated by those concerned, such as school directors, teachers who have participated in educational courses, parents of students, people with access to water and people who have obtained credit. However, the electricity component and the agricultural component, which is limited to tree planting and the installation of a cassava mill, are the two components that pose problems regarding their effectiveness and where OTM has encountered problems motivating its volunteers.

Nevertheless, SR has little evidence about the long-term results and *outcomes* of the program. First, these *outcomes* are not clearly defined in the logical frameworks that accompany the Accord Cadre OTM has with the MAEE of Luxembourg. This Accord Cadre does not talk about the effects the program wants to achieve at the level of families and society. SR does not have information on what children who have completed grade 6 or 9 become: do girls continue to study and become people who contribute to the well-being of the family or the society? Are schools and Parent Teacher Associations (EPAs) becoming development actors in the area? Does access to drinking water have an effect on the health of the population? The evidence that the program achieves these results or the effects it generates is either missing or rather negative. Assajeh, the credit granting organization, gave credit to nine organizations, two of which are truly profitable and able to repay their credit. OTM limits its follow-up to the use of funds and the execution of activities but does not pay much attention to the results and the possible effects of their interventions.

OTM's monitoring of budgets and activities has a positive effect on efficiency: activities are done on time and according to the proposed budgets. An estimate of the cost-benefit relationship confirms the efficiency of the activities: the cost for building of the OTM schools is about \$ 400 per m², a local builder builds antiseismic houses at \$ 340 per m². SR estimates a child's cost per year at school at around \$ 36 and the cost for food (4 meals a week) at \$ 100 a year. Subsidies provided by the program vary between \$ 55 and \$ 15 per child, and are therefore reasonable. It is difficult to judge the cost of the water supply because the construction of the turbine that produces the electricity necessary for the operation of the pumps started in 1995 and it is therefore difficult to obtain the actual costs of this installation. Since

several volunteers are involved in the planning of the OTM interventions, SR notices several initiatives such as the installation of solar panels on the parish of the Petits frères de Sainte Thérèse (PFST) or the installation of a cold room. SR lacks data to assess their efficiency and effectiveness, but SR has doubts about their relevance. These facilities are not funded by the AC but affect the overall efficiency of the activities performed by the organization. The lack of clear business plans and credit criteria makes the credit part of the program not very effective and not very efficient.

The sustainability of the interventions poses several problems. School principals have all expressed the importance of continued funding by OTM to ensure the same level of quality to offer to children. In the AC, OTM emphasized the sustainability of interventions and the need for schools to develop initiatives to ensure the continuation of their services. But none of the directors took initiatives like e.g. reduce spending, make Parents Teachers Associations more accountable for school operations, build capacity to develop initiatives for vulnerable families through e.g. installation of tontines, training of parents and support in the creation of income-generating activities. The operation of the turbine poses many problems and its sustainability is not guaranteed at all. On one side, the costs of its maintenance, its depreciation and operation are not known but, in any case, exceed the capacity of the users of these services. On the other hand, technicalities and spare parts are not available in Haiti. The lack of feasibility studies and business plans explain the problems that OTM is facing at the moment.

The program strengthened partner capacities, especially reporting capabilities. Most partner organizations are able to provide financial reports and quality activities. But for these partner organizations to become true development actors, they need more capacity, such as the ability to plan for the long term and create a clear vision and mission, to innovate and identify innovations and solutions for existing problems, manage conflicts and collaborate with others, influence policies, etc. None of these organizations have these capabilities yet.

The recommendations

The organisational structure

OTM must initiate and follow a process that allows it to specify its mission and vision, its values that it shares, as well as its partnership policy. It must also explain how it sees the role of volunteers. OTM must do so in a participatory manner that will ensure ownership of its strategic decisions by those concerned. At the same time OTM needs to expand its volunteer group and invest in the workings of its organization chart by putting the right people in the different roles and specifying the roles and responsibilities of everyone involved. SR also proposes that OTM, possibly together with the *Cercle des ONGD*, invest in the training of its volunteer group on the concepts of sustainable development, the evolution in international solidarity policies, etc. Finally, it is important for OTM to establish institutional contacts with other NGOs or organizations in both Haiti and Luxembourg to strengthen its own capacities. In this way, OTM can enhance its knowledge of the Haitian context and its project management skills. Collaboration with actors in Haiti provides a more coherent view of the realities of Haiti and more in-depth monitoring of the effects of OTM's interventions.

The program

OTM needs to strengthen ongoing actions to ensure that the investments made will have lasting effects. For schools, SR proposes that OTM develops strategies and initiatives with schools and PTAs to make school more autonomous, and to reinforce the social role that schools must play in their environment. It is a matter of accompanying schools and different structures in processes of reflection and supporting initiatives.

For the water and electricity supply program OTM must resolve or clarify the following points:

- who owns the turbine and who will be responsible for the operation of the turbine;
- to prevent the turbine from becoming a white elephant, a business plan for the operation of the turbine, which offers compelling evidence on the feasibility and sustainability of this investment and includes both technical aspects, such as maintenance and needs in technical and spare parts, and the financial aspects, must be elaborated ;
- if the result of this business plan is negative, it is important that the organization develops alternatives (solar panels or others) to guarantee access to water for the population of Beau Séjour and Viala.

Capacity building

OTM needs to develop a capacity building plan for the 6 partner organizations that are each responsible for a specific project or school. On the basis of an organizational diagnosis and according to the ambitions of these organizations, a capacity building plan must be drawn up and Haitian consultants or organizations must be contracted to support these organizations. If OTM decides to continue working in Haiti, it must invest in a 'strategic' partnership with a Haitian organization able to develop coherent development strategies together with OTM.